The impact of Workplace Bullying on the efficiency of Human Resource Management: Cross-cultural studies

Aleksandra Jovanovic1++

1School of Business, Australian College of Kuwait, Kuwait
2Corresponding Author and 3Speaker: a.jovanovic@ack.edu.kw

Abstract — Workplace bullying is not a problem of the individual, but of the society as a whole, which causes huge losses, in terms of reduced productivity of workers, increased expenditures in health care (due to frequent sick leave) and pension insurance (due to early retirement). The subject of this paper will be workplace bullying as an occurrence, in an attempt to explain the practical examples as well as the consequences that this phenomenon carries within. Moreover, it documents various surveys conducted in Australia, United States of America and Europe, providing evidence of the workplace bullying, its causes and negative effects on the workplace environment. Our findings show that workplace bullying is destroying communication channels and reducing productivity and it can further result in the failure of a business itself. Due to the aforementioned data, which is quite worrying, this paper demonstrates the important role of the efficient human resource management as well as the role of the government and the legislation in combating and preventing this occurrence. The results found in this study have the potential to raise awareness on this topic, which is still quite neglected in some countries.

Keywords: HRM, bullying, law, psychology, leadership

I. INTRODUCTION

What characterizes the economy of the 21st century is knowledge as a broader concept, as a set of different skills which enable human creativity and flexibility. The set of different knowledge and skills that employees possess should contribute to the rapid adaptation of the business to the ever changing conditions in a globalized market. The circumstances that companies face today in the market require quick response to the growing economic innovations. [30] We have witnessed the expansion of the use of the term human resources in the media and professional literature in the recent years. It is quite certain that in today's environment, especially with the advancement of globalization, we face many changes in the requirements of organizations towards the individual and the working environment. [17]

A much higher level of competitiveness, higher demands in the workplace, and job insecurity puts a lot more pressure on employees. The organization and its management play the greatest role in adapting to these changes and reducing the negative impacts.

The link between employee satisfaction and productivity has always been recognized. Interpersonal relationships have a major impact on the effectiveness of each organization. If there is a disorder, regardless of its origin, it will certainly reflect on productivity and have a negative impact on the results of the organization. [2] It is precisely these disorders in interpersonal relationships that represent the various forms of workplace bullying. Many researchers and scholars from various fields such as psychology, law, medicine and sociology are beginning to address these issues. [16]

It could be said that workplace bullying did not exist thirty years ago.[23] Does this mean that the working and living conditions were better, people were more satisfied with the working relationships and they did not even need to deal with this phenomenon? Or it just means that the problem was not clearly defined then and therefore it was not possible to publicly fight against its cause? It can be stated that workplace bullying is not a new phenomenon in the society. However, it certainly took a long time for it to be recognized as a problem and to begin with a more serious exploration and observation of this topic.

Workplace bullying is not a problem that is related to only one type of business or one type of organization. From a historical distance, workplace bullying has only recently become a topic of discussion in the public, as there has been a recognized need to protect the individual. Nevertheless, it can be said that workplace bullying is as old as the human society, because it is closely linked to the ancient human need for power and domination. [19]

A company could not exist without its people, who are considered to be its most valuable resource. We will note, however, that not all companies are equally successful, even when they have products of similar quality.[33] What is the best way to manage human resources to ensure the maximum creativity and intellectual potential of employees in the work
process? Is there a formula for successful human resource management? How to allow them to provide maximum effort in performing their business tasks in order for the company to operate successfully? These are some of the questions we are going to address in this paper through careful observation of the existing data, surveys and empirical studies.

II. MATERIALS AND METHOD

The concept of workplace bullying is seen as a form of much more sophisticated violence that seeks to discriminate, humiliate, or remove an individual or a group of people, and is generally related to the work environment.[4] The scientific aim of this paper is to investigate the importance of workplace bullying and its impact on the business, based on the analysis of the available data. From a social point of view, the aim of this paper is to contribute to raising awareness on this topic, which is still quite neglected in some countries.

Theoretical knowledge and specific research methods are required in order to explore human potential in the true sense of the word and to direct its development. [26] During the preparation of this paper, research was conducted on available literature, analysis of case studies using the case study method, statistics from relevant world institutions, as well as the examples found electronically and in various news articles dealing with this topic.

2.1 Workplace bullying – Research and statistical evidence

Violence and harassment in the workplace is defined by European Union Social Partners, an organization representing workers' rights in Europe. They state that violence and harassment can potentially endanger any worker, regardless of the size of the company, its field and the form of contract it has with the employee. In their opinion, there are various forms of violence and harassment that can endanger workers at work:[13]

- Physical, psychological and / or sexual in nature
- Committed by one or more individuals
- One incident or more systematic patterns of behavior
- Between colleagues, between superiors and subordinates or by third parties such as clients, customers etc.
- Ranging from minor cases such as contempt to much larger acts, including criminal offenses requiring action by public institutions

2.1.2 European Foundation for Improvement of Living and Working Conditions

The European Foundation for the Improvement of Living and Working Conditions is of a particular importance in relation to workplace satisfaction in the European countries. This Foundation has conducted five surveys on working conditions in Europe over the last 20 years. [12]

The Fifth European Working Conditions Survey (2010) interviewed nearly 44,000 respondents in 34 countries (27 EU Member States, Montenegro, Croatia, Turkey, Norway, Albania, Macedonia and Kosovo). Respondents were considered if they were older than 15 years (i.e. above 16 in Spain, England and Norway), employed and living in the country where the survey was conducted, using a multiphase, stratified random sampling method. The target sample size in each country was 1,000 employees, except in Slovenia (1,400), England, Italy and Poland (1,500), Germany and Turkey (2,000), France (3,000) and Belgium (4,000). [12]

In this research, the Foundation observed the concept of Adverse Social Behavior (ASB) in the European Condition Working Survey (ECWS). Respondents answered questions from a questionnaire on a variety of subjects related to respondents’ personal lives as well as their workplace and environment. ASB presented an index based on the answers to specific questions in this questionnaire. In particular, the respondents were questioned whether they had been exposed to any of the following cases at their workplace during the previous 12 months: [12]

- Physical abuse
- Verbal abuse
- Unwanted sexual attention
- Threatening or degrading behavior

Respondents were also asked to indicate if they were a victim of:

- Age discrimination
- Discrimination based on race, ethnicity or skin color
- Discrimination due to affiliation with a particular religion
- Sex discrimination
- Discrimination based on nationality
- Discrimination due to disability
- Sexual orientation discrimination

In addition, respondents indicated if they had any of the health problems such as:

- Hearing problem
- Skin problems
- Headaches
- Muscle pain
- Heart problems
- Respiratory dysfunction
- Injuries
- Depression or anxiety
- Insomnia
- General fatigue

Respondents were also required to indicate the number of days absent from work in the previous 12 months and how many felt that the days were related to an accident at work.

2.1.3 Survey of the Australian Productivity Commission

The impact of Workplace Bullying on the efficiency of Human Resource Management: Cross-cultural studies, ISAS WINTER 2019 Samsun, Turkey
The Productivity Commission Australia is an independent body within the Australian Government that conducts research and advises the Government on economic, social and environmental issues that affect the well-being of Australian residents. In the Benchmarking of Australian Business Regulation: Occupational Health & Safety 2010 survey, this committee examined regulations and evaluated the performance of their implementation to determine their effectiveness. In addition to the physical risks in the workplace, this study also looked at the psychological risks that were associated with bullying. [1]

2.1.4 Research in the United States of America

In the United States, Workplace Bullying Institute (WBI) has conducted significant research on this phenomenon in the workplace. This organization provides individual assistance, research, public education, and trainings to organizations and employees. In addition, it offers legislative protections and advisory services to organizations. The WBI defines bullying as a recurrent abuse that leaves a health impact and is committed against one or more people (targets) by one or more perpetrators. It is abusive behavior that:

- Represents threatening, degrading or intimidating behavior or
- Affects the job, sabotages and prevents the job from being completed or
- Represents verbal abuse

In a report on National Prevalence and US Workforce Affected, the WBI stated that the survey was conducted electronically under controlled conditions and applied on a sample of 1,000 adults during January 27-28, 2014, as a representative sample with a margin of error of +/- 3.2 percentage points. Each access was password protected so that one respondent had the opportunity to access the questionnaire only once. The survey was conducted at a time when the number of non-agricultural workforces was approximately 137,499,000. [10]

III. RESULTS

The following figure shows the data of the Fifth European Working Conditions Survey. [12]

Figure 1 shows that the Baltic countries, central and western Europe and Scandinavia demonstrate the higher percentage than the EU28 average of 14%. Austria, Czech Republic and Finland show the highest percentages of employees who have reported workplace violence or harassment (over 20%), while in half of the eastern European countries (except Slovakia, Slovenia and some Baltic countries) and in all southern European countries a much smaller percentage of workers reported ASB (from 6% in Cyprus to 12% in Croatia)

According to the same survey (Figure 2), women were found to be a slightly more vulnerable group (15.1%) than men (13.3%). The difference is more noticed in some Scandinavian and Baltic countries. In Finland, for example, women are almost twice as many ASB subjects as men. This difference is partially explained by the greater level of exposure of women to sexual harassment. In contrast, men showed a greater degree of exposure to physical violence.

The above information can be seen in the following figure:

Figure 2. ASB by country according to gender [12]

Figure 3. Age difference in ASB application, by country [12]

Data looking at the proportion of ASB in relation to age (Figure 3) show the highest percentage (16.1%) in the group of individuals under 35, while in the group from 35 to 49 years it is 13.8% and 12.2% above 50 years.

According to the research, service sector workers are much more likely to be exposed to ASB because they are in contact with their colleagues, superiors, subordinates, or third parties and because the management of interpersonal relationships in this sector is increasingly complex.
The data in this table represents the sectors in which the occurrence of ASB is much higher than the EU-28 average:

- Health and social work
- Transport and storage
- Accommodation and food service
- Public administration
- Education

Also, the above research dealt with the identification of certain organizational risk factors and working conditions most commonly associated with the workplace violence and harassment, which are presented in the following table:

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Organisational risk factors and working conditions</th>
<th>Specific risk and country’s national contribution</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Job demands</td>
<td>Work intensity (FR), time pressure (FI), high workload (CZ, DE, SE, SI), physically and mentally demanding (FI), tasks work demands (FR), fear and mental strain (DE), high quantitative demands (DE), work pressure (AT, LT), emotionally demanding tasks (FR, IT), job mentally demanding (IT), working with tight deadlines (IT), volume of tasks (CZ)</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Unsocial hours</td>
<td>Night shifts (ES), shift changes (DE)</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Autonomy</td>
<td>Job control (FR), low influence at work (DE), low work discretion (IT)</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Job insecurity</td>
<td>Job insecurity, uncertainty (ES), fear of job loss (AT)</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Managerial style</td>
<td>Tyrannical leadership (NO), managerial authoritarian styles (ES, IT), managerial conduct (DE), limited managerial support (CZ), non-participative leadership (IT), autocratic style (UK), abusive management (MT), inadequate staff policy (SK)</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

| Social environment (CZ), strong identity groups (DK) | Hostile environment (SE), internal conflicts (BE, ES, LV), poor social relationships (DE, ES, FI, FR), poor personal relationships (SK), internal competition (AT, BE, LV), poor/lack of communication (CZ, ES), lack of social support (DE), rivalry among colleagues and personal resentment (AT), poor level of cooperation (CZ), informal groups and cliques (CZ), strong identity groups (DK) |

| Organisational factors | Ambiguous job roles (ES), inappropriate work organisation and conflict management (ES), role conflicts (DE), poor organisational structure (DE), bad organisation (SI), staff shortage (ES) |

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Changes in management</th>
<th>Changes in the organisation (FI), changes in management (CZ, FI, IT)</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Organisational changes/restructuring</td>
<td>Restructuring (FR), offshoring (FR)</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

Table 3: Main organisational risk factors and working conditions associated with violence and harassment [12]

According to this study [12], workers who reported being subjected to harassment or maltreatment also reported a much higher percentage of mental health problems than those who were not exposed to any form of workplace harassment:

- Four times higher percentage of depression (32% vs. 8%)
- Almost four times higher percentage of sleep problems (47% and 16%)
- Almost 1.8 times higher percentage of general fatigue (62% vs. 34%)
- Twice as much stress (52% vs. 24%)

The negative impact of ASB on motivation and job satisfaction is a general problem. According to studies conducted in 10 countries [12], people show less job satisfaction and therefore less involvement in achieving both individual and organizational goals. They most often withdraw into themselves, take no initiative and avoid making important decisions, all because of the constant unresolved harassment they experience in the workplace.

Although research indicates that the real costs incurred as a result of violence and harassment in the workplace is difficult to calculate accurately, mostly due to unreported cases, attempts have been made to account for them: [12]
The Commission states that difficulties in performing country-by-country comparisons in Australia arise because of the different definitions of this term in them, such as: [1]

- Commonwealth members view this phenomenon as an act against a person in the workplace, while New South Wales, Victoria, Western Australia and South Australia view it as an act against a worker / employee
- Most states define bullying as a recurring event, while New South Wales leaves open the possibility that an isolated incident can also be seen as a form of abuse
- Western Australia and the Southern Territories include any inappropriate behavior in this term, while Queensland does not include sexual harassment

This research indicates that lower rates of this occurrence are identified in agriculture, forestry, fisheries, construction and mining (about 1%) compared to production (8.7%). Men are also reported to be more likely to report abuse than women, which they consider to be a consequence of cultural factors such as fear of punishment and job loss. [1]

Based on the survey performed by the Workplace Bullying Institute in the United States of America, the following is concluded: [28]

- 20% of U.S. employees have experienced some form of offensive behavior at work
- 7% currently experience some kind of abusive behavior in the workplace
- 21% witnessed the appearance of bullying in their workplace
- 23% are aware that there is a bullying in the work environment
- 28% said they were not aware of this phenomenon.

Bullying is also reported to be much more common for men than women (69% versus 31%), and targets in both cases are more common for women (57% for male abusers and 68% for women who carry out this type of behavior). [28]

In addition, research has shown that bullying perpetrators are mainly employees in a higher position, managers (40.1%) over those below them. This percentage is twice lower when it comes to employees in the same rank (19%) and even lower when it comes to employees in a lower position in the organization (7.1%). [17]

It is a common knowledge that workplace bullying occurs in environments where there is a lack of a good leadership team, or where people in different leadership positions are incapable or uninterested in working. In such cases, victims of workplace bullying are usually individuals with a range of positive traits and high professionalism. Unfortunately, they are often recognized by the bully as dangerous because such people reinforce his sense of incompetence.

3.1 Consequences of Workplace Bullying on Business Efficiency
In some studies, workplace bullying represents only psychological abuse and is studied separately from other forms of abuse, such as sexual, physical, and moral, while in other studies, all these abuses represent only different forms of workplace bullying. The victim's medical condition can be severely impaired due to the constant pressure caused by workplace bullying and some of the symptoms are: anxiety, depression, panic attacks, dizziness, skin changes and lack of sleep. In addition to these changes, mobbing also affects behavioral changes, so the victim of mobbing can become aggressive or indulge in various vices such as excessive alcohol or medication. [22]

What characterizes the victims of workplace bullying is a sense of guilt, loneliness and a sense of lower worth. Initially, workplace bullying victims usually blame themselves for the situation, and feelings of confusion and anxiety may occur. The victims often hide their problem and do not want to discuss it with their families and friends. It often happens that they come across as condemned and belittled when they bring up their problem in public. This contributes to making the victims think that they are guilty and being exposed to a serious mental condition. Such feelings further contribute to the feeling of powerlessness in the hope of solving their problem and often have fatal consequences. [15]

It is important to note that some victims of workplace bullying are aware of what is happening and are clearly fighting to prevent this occurrence. This reaction is characteristic of strong and intelligent people who use legal measures and media to publicly point to this phenomenon and prevent its further development. However, it is a very exhausting process that in any case leaves great consequences on the victim. [18] Workplace bullying affects all aspects of a victims’ life and manifests itself in all areas: their family life, relationships with friends and co-workers. It causes panic reactions, behavioral disorders and even suicidal ideas as the only way out. [3] Apart from being directly affected, workplace bullying also has a strong impact on their work environment. Post-traumatic stress disorder (PTSD) is a name recognized by the World Health Organization and used for diagnosis that occurs as a result of workplace bullying. [20] It is an extremely traumatic condition that can reduce the level of general immunity of the organism and lead to problems with the digestive system and cardiovascular system. The main indicators of PTSD are: [20]

- Anxiety
- Depression
- Hypersensitivity
- Dizziness
- Heart problems
- Headache
- Sleep disorders

Existence and indication of this type of disorder by the World Health Organization indicates that workplace bullying has great consequences, not only on the organization but also on the person who was exposed to workplace bullying. These consequences can be very serious and have a long-term effect. [15], [3]

In addition to the direct consequences of workplace bullying on the health of victims, such as various psychosomatic disorders, the negative effects are also manifested in other segments of the economy and society in general. For example, workplace bullying leads to reduced employee productivity due to job dissatisfaction and lack of motivation to work. [3], [25] As a result, the percentage of unemployment is rising. This further creates costs in the state budget in the form of payment of unemployment benefits. [35] Also, the state allocates large funds for sickness benefits or for the early retirement of victims due to the illness and frequent absence from work. [12], [36]

According to some studies, the emergence of workplace bullying is a major material loss for the national economy and it is estimated to be several billion euros. In fact, in the UK it is stated that 40,000 working hours are lost due to the effects of stress, while a third of the causes are related to the workplace bullying. Some data indicate that the employer loses between € 17,500 and € 50,000 a year, while the loss in the economy is estimated at up to € 50 billion. [34]

It is a problem that covers all spheres of social reality. The occurrence of workplace bullying often leaves deep consequences on the individual, broader social and global economic front, so it is necessary to work on raising awareness about this topic, ways to protect the victims and penalize those who are encouraging this type of behavior. [32], [8]

IV. DISCUSSION

4.1 Causes of Workplace Bullying

The real question is how workplace bullying actually occurs. One of the main factors is certainly the poor organization of the business itself. In all the cases examined, an incompetent management system and poor organization of business within the company itself were observed. The character of the victim is also one of the important factors for the occurrence of this phenomenon. It should be said that the working environment is different from other living environments and it must be guided by certain rules of conduct. This certainly implies successful cooperation between colleagues, which must be first and foremost encouraged by the governing body.

The emergence of conflict is always a danger to the organization, but the role of the governing body is crucial and it must strive for the conflict to be successfully resolved. If this obligation is neglected, and this is often due to a lack of knowledge or personal incapacity, conflicts escalate and gradually turn into a type of workplace bullying. Dr. Layman clearly describes the direction of the development of this occurrence in his Encyclopedia of Mobbing: [24]
1. In the beginning, there is a conflict that management, despite its responsibility, fails to resolve.

2. Conflict increases only over time, with the ill-treated person suffering hostilities on a daily basis.

3. Finally, management is forced to react. At this point, management very often accepts the gossip and complaints of colleagues, trusting them without questioning their authenticity. The abused person rarely gets the opportunity to speak in his or her own favor, or it has no influence because the judgment has already been rendered.

4. The attitude of management causes such a bad reputation of a mistreated person that it is very difficult for her to survive in that workplace, in that organization and even in the labor market in general.

Given the fact that many countries around the world are adopting sanctions against workplace abuse, we can see that workplace bullying as a topic takes on a large scale both nationally and globally. Large multinational companies are also adopting internal rules that have the goal to prevent workplace bullying. [6] In fact, in such companies there is a threat of dismissal of all those involved in workplace bullying, irrespective of their position and rank in the organization. Therefore, they are aware that only a healthy working environment and the harmonious interpersonal relationships lead to the desired business results.

In the opinion of psychologists, the problem of workplace bullying can be solved by confronting the bullies, especially if they are in a superior position. However, victims often do not dare to engage in such behavior, being afraid of criticism and a possibility of losing their jobs. Often, it is easier for them to “play out” obedience while maintaining their beliefs for themselves. Unfortunately, many victims deal with stress in extremely inadequate ways, resorting to undesirable remedies that only seemingly reduce frustration. [7]

The prevention of the escalation of the conflict into a more serious condition is a basic obligation of the employer. This can be ensured by educating managers at all levels about conflict management. It is also the responsibility of the employer to set clear rules that will provide explanations and instructions for how employees should respond if they notice that certain conditions or conflicts can develop into workplace bullying and thus prevent this phenomenon from the very beginning. [14]

Furthermore, early recognition and action is of great importance. However, this is not always straightforward, as managers must have the ability to identify the process that is evolving into workplace bullying early on. It is necessary to clearly identify the person or people that employees will be able to address in such instances. It is very important that these people have the authority to act in isolated cases. One possible way of early prevention is to establish the organizational order and ethics of behavior. [27]

As mentioned earlier, victim protection is a basic obligation of managers if a workplace bullying occurs. Management must ensure that victims of workplace bullying are protected from any marking in order to maintain their dignity and professional reputation. If necessary, the victim may also be sent for sick leave or offered professional rehabilitation. [21]

The achievement of the set strategic goals and high business standards are conditioned by well-coordinated communication of the management. Effective communication in an organization is defined as means of coordinating and controlling teamwork, individual socialization and integration into the organizational team. [5] If there are barriers in communication, it becomes difficult to exchange experience and it does not motivate employees, which further leads to dissatisfaction at work. Organizations that achieve harmonious communication have a good working atmosphere because the work environment is not only a place where employees come to work; it is also a place where employees spend a significant part of their lives.

Certain legal measures have a great role to play in the fight against workplace bullying, which will ensure the right of every employee to physical and mental health at work. [29] Thus, employers are obliged to periodically exercise internal control in order to recognize the potential for workplace bullying and to prevent this harmful occurrence in a timely manner.

In particular, it should be noted that workplace bullying does not mean an isolated event, but rather a large number of negative behaviors that reoccur over a long period of time. The employee is advised to contact the psychologist of the organization for help. If there is no such expert, then he should contact a union representative or a manager, provided that they are not the ones who are committing this type of work abuse. [5]

It is very important for the society to become aware of this phenomenon. The negative impact of workplace bullying and the ways to prevent it should be pointed out to the public with the help of legislation and media. In Sweden, workplace bullying protection is regulated by the Criminal Code and the victim can claim compensation for the damage caused. In this country, even the everyday behavior of a superior at work, who assigns tasks to an employee in an authoritative manner and in an elevated tone, is considered unacceptable and immediately defined as workplace bullying. [11]

V. CONCLUSION

Human resources and their management are becoming the focus of economic science as well as market trends in contemporary economic thought. Despite the great advancements in information technology, human resources and human capital still retain a primary place in the organization. Corporate governance as well as strategic positioning and success of businesses in the market are increasingly dependent on efficient human resource management.
In the main hypothesis of this paper, it was pointed out that workplace bullying is a negative factor influencing the efficiency of human resource management.[31] The modern trend in human resources management brings the notion of employee motivation to the very top of their interest. [17] In order to successfully overcome conflicts, adequate training of human resources managers is required.[7]

In addition, it is essential that every government clearly defines laws that will protect the worker from any kind of harassment in the workplace.[9] What is even more important is the proper implementation and monitoring of compliance with the laws after their adoption. Also, the government can make a significant contribution to raising awareness of this phenomenon through various media and organizations that will publicly engage in the problem of workplace bullying. In addition, the government could show support by establishing institutions that will assist victims of workplace bullying.[10]

I believe that papers such as this one, which emphasize the need to care for people in the company in order to achieve corporate goals, are much needed worldwide. The importance of such research also contributes to the scientific understanding of human resources management problems, whose importance is recognized today in almost every part of the world.

We can conclude that man, as a major participant in the business relations, has also become a major resource of enterprises. Moreover, successful corporate governance and success of enterprises in the market in the 21st century depend largely on abilities and skills of the well-selected, motivated and successfully managed human resources. [30]

REFERENCES


[35] Vučević T. (2008), Mobing kao devijantna pojava u radu – Sociologija rada, Novi Sad